Ice Prediction Workshop Test Case Selection

Richard Hann, Isik Ozcer, Alberto Pueyo and Andy Broeren

September 17, 2020

Test Case Selection Process

1st Round Selection

> Test configurations were sorted into three categories:

- Ice accretion on 3D geometry
- Ice accretion on 2D geometry
- Collection efficiency on 3D geometry
- Using the test configurations summarized in Richard Hann's presentation, organizing committee members can indicate:
 - Baseline—simulations performed by all participants
 - Optional—at participants' discretion
 - Consider for future workshop
 - Response deadline was August 24, 2020.
- ➢ Richard's task force compiled and sorted the responses.
 - Discussed during August 27, 2020 meeting.

2nd Round Selection

➢Next step is to identify specific cases for each configuration.

• Based upon September 14, 2020 meeting, test cases have been identified—we are here!

Case Selection Criteria

> Distinction is made between "configurations" (i.e. geometries) and "cases".

- The number of configurations has been limited to bound the amount of work required to create models and grids and, therefore, encourage the use of 3D icing codes.
- There could be several cases under a given configuration (selection of which and how many will be part of a second round in the selection process).
- ➢ For the baseline cases, at least one configuration for each of the 3 categories is retained.
 - In each category, the most voted configuration(s) were selected
- Optional cases can still be considered as baseline cases candidates for future workshops.

Configurations Summary

Baseline Configurations

Ice accretion on 3D Geometry

- 36-inch chord NACA 0012, 30 deg. sweep, AoA = 0 deg.
- 36-inch chord NACA 0012, 45 deg. sweep, AoA = 0 deg.
- ➢Ice accretion on 2D Geometry
 - 18-inch chord NACA 23012, AoA = 2 deg.
- Collection efficiency on 3D Geometry
 - NACA 64A008 finite swept tail, AoA = 6 deg.
 - Three element airfoil, 36-inch nested chord, AoA = 4 deg.

Optional Configurations

➢Ice accretion on 3D Geometry

• 36-inch chord NACA 0012, 30 deg. sweep

➢Ice accretion on 2D Geometry

- 72-inch chord NACA 23012
- ➤Collection efficiency on 3D Geometry
 - Three element airfoil, 36-inch nested chord, AoA = 4 deg.
 - Axisymmetric inlet at AoA = 15 deg.

Ice Accretion on 3D Geometry

Test Case Summary Ice Accretion on 3D Geometry

Baseline Test Cases

- ≻Ref. AIAA 2014-2200
- ➤ 36-inch chord NACA 0012, 30 deg. sweep, 0 deg. AoA
 - 2 cases, varying temperature
- ➤ 36-inch chord NACA 0012, 45 deg. sweep, 0 deg. AoA
 - 2 cases—conditions identical to 30 deg. sweep.

Optional Test Cases

- ≻Ref. AIAA 2020-2814
- ➢ 36-inch chord NACA 0012, 30 deg. sweep, 0 deg. AoA
 - 2 cases, each with monomodal drop distribution

| ID | Title | Test facility | Year Data Type | Geometry | Reynolds (millions) | Air speed | MVD μm | LWC g/m3 | Temperatu I re | Reference | Vote for baseline 0/1 | Vote for optional 0/1 | Vote for future worksho p 0/1 |
|----|---|------------------|-------------------------------------|--|------------------------|-----------|-----------|---------------|---------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|--|
| 1 | 36-inch swept NACA 0012 - complete scallops | IRT | 20143D Scan | NACA 0012. swept 45, AoA 0 | 7 | 200 kts | 32.6 | 0.54 | -6.7 C A (total) | AIAA 2014 2613 | 5 | 5 | 1 |
| 2 | 36-inch swept NACA 0012 - incomplete scallops | IRT | 20143D Scan | NACA 0012. swept 30, AoA 4 | 7 | 200 kts | 15 | 0.6 | -6.7 C / | AIAA 2014 2613 | 7 | 3 | 1 |
| 3 | 36-inch swept NACA 0012 - rime | IRT | 20143D Scan | NACA 0012. swept 30, AoA 4 | 7 | 200 kts | 15 | 0.6 | -17.8 C / | AIAA 2014 2613 | 5 | 5 | 0 |
| 4 | GLC305 swept wing - complete scallops | IRT | 2003 Tracing / Cp | GLC305, tapered, swept 28, AoA 4 | 4 | 250 mph | 20 | 0.68 | 25 F (total) / | AIAA 2003 730 | 2 | 5 | 2 |
| 5 | GLC305 swept wing - incomplete scallops | IRT | 2003 Tracing / Cp | GLC305, tapered, swept 28, AoA 4 | 4 | 150 mph | 20 | 0.65 | 25 F (total) / | AIAA 2003 730 | 1 | 4 | 2 |
| 6 | 36-inch swept NACA 0012, small K (set of 7) | IRT | 2014 Tracings, photos, Cp, ice mass | NACA 0012, swept 30 - 45, AoA 0 | 3 | 45 m/s | 15 | 1.5 | 257 - 269 K A (static) | AIAA 2014 2200 | 6 | 3 | 1 |
| 7 | 36-inch swept NACA 0012, large K (set of 5) | IRT | 2014Tracings, photos, Cp, ice mass | NACA 0012, swept 30 - 45, AoA 0 | 7 | 103 m/s | 32 | 0.45 | 257 - 266 K / (static) | AIAA 2014 2200 | 9 | 1 | 0 |
| 8 | Helicopter tail rotor in edgewise flow | IRT | 20143D scans | Bell 206B tail rotor @ 1200,2100 rpm | 0.5 - 1 | 31 m/s | 15 | 0.5 | 14 F A (static) | AIAA 2014 2612 | 1 | 0 | 10 |
| 9 | Small scale fan | ISU | 2018 Photographs, pressure loss | Fan/spinner based on Boeing 18- inch fan rig, @2500 rpm | 0.2 | 15 m/s | 20-100 | 0.5-2.0 |)-515 C / (static) | AIAA 2018-3013 | 2 | 0 | 9 |
| 10 | 36-inch swept NACA 0012, ref AF2175 | IRT | 20203D scans, ice mass | NACA 0012, swept 30, AoA 0 | 5 | 150 kts | 20-25 | 0.6-2.3 | 3-1017.5 C (static) | AIAA-2020-2814 | 6 | 2 | 2 |
| 11 | 15-inch swept NACA 0012, ref AF2175 | IRT | 20203D scans, ice mass | NACA 0012, swept 30, AoA 0 | 3.5 | 217 kts | 20-25 | 0.75- 1.88 | -1425 C / | AIAA-2020-2814 | 5 | 3 | 3 |
| 12 | CRM65 inboard, TG2418 | IRT | 20183D scans, Cp | CRM65 20% semispan section, swept 35, AoA 3.7 | 21 (full- MAC) | 129 kts | 25 | 1 | -3.7 C I (static) 2 | NASA/CR-2018- 219781 | 4 | 2 | 6 |
| 13 | CRM65 inboard, TG2408 | IRT | 20183D scans, Cp | CRM65 20% semispan section, swept 35, AoA 3.7 | 24 (full- MAC) | 129 kts | 25 | 1 | -17.3 C (static) 2 | NASA/CR-2018- 219781 | 3 | 2 | 5 |
| 14 | CRM65 midspan, TH2464 | IRT | 20183D scans, Cp | CRM65 64% semispan section, swept 35, AoA 3.7 | 22 (full- MAC) | 129 kts | 25 | 1 | -3.6 C I (static) 2 | NASA/CR-2018- 219781 | 5 | 2 | 5 |
| 15 | CRM65 midspan, TH2431 | IRT | 20183D scans, Cp | CRM65 64% semispan section, swept 35, AoA 3.7 | 24 (full- MAC) | 129 kts | 25 | 1 | -17.5 C (static) 2 | NASA/CR-2018- 219781 | 5 | 1 | 4 |

Ice Accretion on 3D Geometry Baseline Cases

36-inch swept NACA 0012, cases from AIAA-2014-2200

30 deg Sweep—suggested baseline cases

| Run # | Airspeed | Drop | LWC | Static | Icing | Experimental Ice | Corrected Experimental | LEWICE3D Ice Mass | Experimental | LEWICE3D | Experimental | LEWICE3D | LEWICE3D Ice Shape | Leading Edge |
|--------|----------|---------|------------------|-------------|-------|----------------------|--------------------------|-------------------|-------------------|-------------------|-----------------|-----------------|--|--------------|
| | | Size | | Temperature | Time | Mass per Unit Length | Ice Mass per Unit Length | per Unit Length | Void Density | Void Density | Ice Shape Area | Ice Shape Area | Area (p _{ice} =917 g/m ³) | Freezing |
| | m/s | microns | g/m ³ | ĸ | min. | g/m | g/m | g/m | Kg/m ³ | Kg/m ³ | cm ³ | cm ³ | cm ³ | Fraction |
| AF2155 | 45 | 15 | 1.50 | 255 | 20 | 787 | 943 | 752 | 505 | 219 | 17.6 | 34.4 | 8.0 | 0.76 |
| AF2140 | 45 | 15 | 1.50 | 264 | 20 | 906 | 906 | 799 | 494 | 186 | 17.0 | 43.0 | 8.1 | 0.39 |
| AF2138 | 45 | 15 | 1.50 | 266 | 20 | 1170 | 1178 | 802 | 446 | 172 | 24.9 | 46.7 | 8.0 | 0.30 |
| AF2139 | 45 | 15 | 1.50 | 266 | 20 | 1191 | 1191 | 802 | 435 | 172 | 26.5 | 46.7 | 8.0 | 0.30 |
| AF2141 | 45 | 15 | 1.50 | 268 | 20 | 1113 | 1113 | 806 | 475 | 161 | 22.4 | 50.1 | 8.0 | 0.22 |
| AF2153 | 103 | 32 | 0.47 | 257 | 5 | NA | NA | 467 | NA | 331 | 7.8 | 14.4 | 21.2 | 0.63 |
| AF2154 | 103 | 32 | 0.47 | 257 | 12 | 827 | 1145 | 1176 | 484 | 331 | 21.0 | 35.5 | 5.1 | 0.63 |
| AF2146 | 103 | 32 | 0.47 | 257 | 20 | 1633 | 1895 | 1994 | 538 | 331 | 33.5 | 60.2 | 12.5 | 0.63 |
| AF2144 | 103 | 32 | 0.47 | 262 | 20 | 1774 | 2002 | 2037 | 417 | 308 | 44.7 | 66.2 | 21.5 | 0.40 |
| AF2148 | 103 | 32 | 0.47 | 263 | 2 | NA | NA | 183 | NA | 301 | 4.9 | 6.1 | 21.6 | 0.35 |
| AF2149 | 103 | 32 | 0.47 | 263 | 5 | NA | NA | 475 | NA | 301 | 11.8 | 15.8 | 2.0 | 0.35 |
| AF2150 | 103 | 32 | 0.47 | 263 | 12 | 893 | 1160 | 1196 | 491 | 301 | 25.7 | 39.7 | 5.0 | 0.35 |
| AF2143 | 103 | 32 | 0.47 | 263 | 20 | 1830 | 1938 | 2054 | 355 | 301 | 48.9 | 68.2 | 12.6 | 0.35 |
| AF2142 | 103 | 32 | 0.47 | 264 | 20 | 1814 | 2060 | 2079 | 365 | 291 | 49.6 | 71.4 | 21.7 | 0.31 |
| AF2151 | 103 | 32 | 0.47 | 266 | 5 | NA | NA | 477 | NA | 261 | 9.3 | 18.3 | 22.0 | 0.22 |
| AF2152 | 103 | 32 | 0.47 | 266 | 12 | 779 | 1012 | 1222 | 557 | 261 | 15.4 | 46.8 | 5.0 | 0.22 |
| AF2145 | 103 | 32 | 0.47 | 266 | 20 | 1429 | 1618 | 2119 | 459 | 261 | 34.0 | 81.1 | 12.7 | 0.22 |

36-inch swept NACA 0012, cases from AIAA-2014-2200

45 deg Sweep—suggested baseline cases

| Run # | Airspeed | Drop | LWC | Static | Experimental Ice | Corrected Experimental | LEWICE3D Ice Mass | Experimental | LEWICE3D | Experimental | LEWICE3D | LEWICE3D Ice Shape | Leading Edge |
|--------|----------|---------|------------------|-------------|----------------------|--------------------------|-------------------|-------------------|-------------------|-----------------|-----------------|--|--------------|
| | | Size | | Temperature | Mass per Unit Length | Ice Mass per Unit Length | per Unit Length | Void Density | Void Density | Ice Shape Area | Ice Shape Area | Area (p _{ice} =917 g/m ³) | Freezing |
| | m/s | microns | g/m ³ | к | g/m | g/m | g/m | Kg/m ³ | Kg/m ³ | cm ³ | cm ³ | cm ³ | Fraction |
| AF1790 | 45 | 15 | 1.50 | 257 | 380 | 454 | 536 | 325 | 106 | 12.3 | 50.4 | 5.6 | 0.80 |
| AF1789 | 45 | 15 | 1.50 | 259 | 376 | 483 | 546 | 323 | 139 | 13.8 | 39.2 | 5.6 | 0.71 |
| AF1793 | 45 | 15 | 1.50 | 262 | 416 | 491 | 560 | 407 | 138 | 11.5 | 40.5 | 5.6 | 0.56 |
| AF1788 | 45 | 15 | 1.50 | 265 | 536 | 557 | 581 | 380 | 136 | 14.5 | 42.7 | 5.4 | 0.41 |
| AF1794 | 45 | 15 | 1.50 | 265 | 526 | 594 | 581 | 351 | 136 | 14.5 | 42.7 | 5.4 | 0.41 |
| AF1792 | 45 | 15 | 1.50 | 267 | 702 | 706 | 582 | 374 | 132 | 18.6 | 44.2 | 5.6 | 0.31 |
| AF1791 | 45 | 15 | 1.50 | 269 | 534 | 538 | 579 | 380 | 127 | 12.6 | 45.4 | 5.5 | 0.20 |
| AF1799 | 103 | 32 | 0.45 | 257 | 1476 | 1582 | 1440 | 437 | 298 | 34.4 | 48.3 | 15.3 | 0.74 |
| AF1798 | 103 | 32 | 0.45 | 261 | 1467 | 1576 | 1475 | 328 | 275 | 45.7 | 53.5 | 15.4 | 0.53 |
| AF1797 | 103 | 32 | 0.45 | 263 | 1339 | 1432 | 1497 | 283 | 265 | 47.8 | 56.6 | 15.5 | 0.43 |
| AF1796 | 103 | 32 | 0.45 | 265 | 1340 | 1438 | 1539 | 367 | 244 | 38.3 | 63.0 | 15.7 | 0.31 |
| AF1795 | 103 | 32 | 0.45 | 266 | 1449 | 1599 | 1548 | 402 | 230 | 36.9 | 67.2 | 15.7 | 0.25 |

36-inch swept NACA 0012, large K (set of 5)—Baseline Cases



Table 2. Experimental and analytical ice shape characteristics for 30° swept NACA 0012 wing.

| Run # | Airspeed | Drop | LWC | Static | lcing | Experimental Ice | Corrected Experimental | LEWICE3D Ice Mass | Experimental | LEWICE3D | Experimental | LEWICE3D | LEWICE3D Ice Shape | Leading Edge |
|--------|----------|---------|------------------|-------------|-------|----------------------|--------------------------|-------------------|-------------------|-------------------|-----------------|-----------------|--|--------------|
| | | Size | | Temperature | Time | Mass per Unit Length | Ice Mass per Unit Length | per Unit Length | Void Density | Void Density | Ice Shape Area | Ice Shape Area | Area (p _{ice} =917 g/m ³) | Freezing |
| | m/s | microns | g/m ³ | к | min. | g/m | g/m | g/m | Kg/m ³ | Kg/m ³ | cm ³ | cm ³ | cm ³ | Fraction |
| AF2146 | 103 | 32 | 0.47 | 257 | 20 | 1633 | 1895 | 1994 | 538 | 331 | 33.5 | 60.2 | 12.5 | 0.63 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| AF2145 | 103 | 32 | 0.47 | 266 | 20 | 1429 | 1618 | 2119 | 459 | 261 | 34.0 | 81.1 | 12.7 | 0.22 |

b) 30° sweep

Table 1. Experimental and analytical ice shape characteristics for 45° swept NACA 0012 wing.

| Run # | Airspeed | Drop | LWC | Static | Experimental Ice | Corrected Experimental | LEWICE3D Ice Mass | Experimental |
|--------|----------|---------|------------------|-------------|----------------------|--------------------------|-------------------|-------------------|
| | | Size | | Temperature | Mass per Unit Length | Ice Mass per Unit Length | per Unit Length | Void Density |
| | m/s | microns | g/m ³ | К | g/m | g/m | g/m | Kg/m ³ |
| AF1799 | 103 | 32 | 0.45 | 257 | 1476 | 1582 | 1440 | 437 |
| AF1795 | 103 | 32 | 0.45 | 266 | 1449 | 1599 | 1548 | 402 |



36-inch swept NACA 0012, large K (set of 5: AF2146)-Baseline







c) static temperature, 257 K; icing time, 20 minutes

Figure 15. Ice shape comparisons for 30° swept wing. Icing conditions: airspeed 103 m/s; liquid water content, 0.47 g/m³; static pressure, 92321 Pa; MVD, 32 μm.

36-inch swept NACA 0012, large K (set of 5: AF2145)-Baseline



- LEWICE3D (Void Density)
- LEWICE3D (Standard Density)
- LEWICE3D (Exp. Density)
- Experiment Station 1
- Experiment Station 2





1) static temperature, 266 K; icing time, 20 minutes

Figure 15. Ice shape comparisons for 30° swept wing. Icing conditions: airspeed 103 m/s; liquid water content, 0.47 g/m³; static pressure, 92321 Pa; MVD, 32 μm.

36-inch swept NACA 0012, large K (set of 5: AF1799)-Baseline



- LEWICE3D (Void Density)
- LEWICE3D (Standard Density)
- LEWICE3D (Exp. Density)
- Experiment Station 1
- Experiment Station 2





a) static temperature, 257 K

Figure 13. Ice shape comparisons for 45° swept wing. Icing conditions: airspeed 103 m/s; icing time 20 minutes; liquid water content, 0.45 g/m³; static pressure, 94463 Pa; MVD, 32 μm.

36-inch swept NACA 0012, large K (set of 5: AF1795)-Baseline



- LEWICE3D (Void Density)
 LEWICE3D (Standard Density)
- LEWICE3D (Exp. Density)
- Experiment Station 1
- Experiment Station 2





e) static temperature, 266 K

Figure 13. - Concluded. Ice shape comparisons for 45° swept wing. Icing conditions: airspeed 103 m/s; icing time 20 minutes; liquid water content, 0.45 g/m³; static pressure, 94463 Pa; MVD, 32 μm.

Ice Accretion on 3D Geometry Optional Cases

3D Scanned ice shapes on 36-in swept NACA0012 from NASA IRT—30 deg. sweep

• AIAA-2020-2814









| | | | | | Test F | Result | s (Ref | erence | e AF21 | 73) | | | | | |
|--------|-------|-------|---------------------|-------|--------|--------|--------------|----------------|--------|--------|--------|--------|-------|-----------------|------------------|
| Run | v | MVD | LWC | Ts | Tt | Time | | | Mod-1 | Mod-1 | Std | Std | Mass | Volume | ρ _{eff} |
| Number | (kts) | (µm) | (g/m ³) | (°C) | (°C) | (min) | $\beta_0 Ac$ | n _o | Pair | delP | Pair | delP | g | in ³ | (g/cm |
| | | | | | | | | | (psig) | (psid) | (psig) | (psid) | | | |
| AF2881 | 224.0 | 20.00 | 0.50 | -10.0 | -3.4 | 17.7 | 1.33 | 0.40 | 19.4 | 49.9 | | | 365.5 | 36.1 | 0.62 |
| AF2882 | 224.0 | 21.40 | 1.12 | -15.2 | -8.5 | 7.7 | 1.33 | 0.40 | | | 15.6 | 11.6 | 322.1 | 28.1 | 0.70 |
| AF2883 | 224.0 | 21.40 | 1.12 | -15.2 | -8.5 | 7.7 | 1.33 | 0.40 | 10.0 | 30.0 | 10.0 | 5.0 | 340.8 | 29.0 | 0.72 |
| AF2884 | 224.0 | 21.30 | 1.54 | -17.5 | -10.9 | 5.6 | 1.33 | 0.40 | 15.0 | 80.0 | 15.0 | 7.0 | 366.7 | 30.2 | 0.74 |
| AF2885 | 224.0 | 25.00 | 1.85 | -19.4 | -12.8 | 4.4 | 1.33 | 0.40 | 15.0 | 100.0 | 15.0 | 10.0 | 366.5 | 29.8 | 0.75 |
| AF2893 | 224.0 | 21.30 | 1.54 | -17.5 | -10.9 | 5.6 | 1.33 | 0.40 | 15.0 | 80.0 | 15.0 | 7.0 | 346.4 | 29.7 | 0.71 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

| | | | | | Test F | Result | s (Ref | erenc | e AF21 | 75) | | | | | |
|--------|-------|-------|---------------------|-------|--------|--------|-------------------|-------|--------|--------|--------|--------|-------|-----------------|----------------------|
| Run | v | MVD | LWC | Ts | Tt | Time | | | Mod-1 | Mod-1 | Std | Std | Mass | Volume | Peff |
| Number | (kts) | (μm) | (g/m ³) | (°C) | (°C) | (min) | β ₀ Ac | no | Pair | delP | Pair | delP | g | in ³ | (g/cm ³) |
| | | | | | | | | | (psig) | (psid) | (psig) | (psid) | | | |
| AF2886 | 150.0 | 20.00 | 0.64 | -7.5 | -4.5 | 22.5 | 1.33 | 0.40 | 19.5 | 50.5 | | | 368.3 | 34.4 | 0.65 |
| AF2887 | 150.0 | 21.40 | 1.43 | -12.7 | -9.7 | 9.7 | 1.33 | 0.40 | | | 15.7 | 11.7 | 329.9 | 29.6 | 0.68 |
| AF2888 | 150.0 | 21.40 | 1.43 | -12.7 | -9.7 | 9.7 | 1.33 | 0.40 | 10.0 | 30.0 | 10.0 | 5.0 | 351.0 | 31.4 | 0.68 |
| AF2889 | 150.0 | 21.30 | 1.96 | -15.1 | -12.1 | 7.1 | 1.33 | 0.40 | 15.0 | 80.0 | 15.0 | 7.0 | 359.3 | 31.2 | 0.70 |
| AF2890 | 150.0 | 25.00 | 2.36 | -17.3 | -14.3 | 5.4 | 1.33 | 0.40 | 15.0 | 100.0 | 15.0 | 10.0 | 373.4 | 31.9 | 0.71 |
| AF2891 | 150.0 | 21.30 | 1.96 | -15.1 | -12.1 | 7.1 | 1.33 | 0.40 | 15.0 | 80.0 | 15.0 | 7.0 | 384.7 | 31.9 | 0.74 |
| AF2894 | 150.0 | 21.30 | 1.96 | -15.1 | -12.1 | 7.1 | 1.33 | 0.40 | 15.0 | 80.0 | 15.0 | 7.0 | 362.1 | 31.7 | 0.70 |

| | | | | | Test F | Result | s (Ref | erence | e AF21 | 78) | | | | | |
|--------|------------|-------|--------|-------|---------|---------------|-------------------|----------------|----------------|--------|----------------------------|--------|-------|--------|---------|
| Run | V (kto) | MVD | LWC | Ts | Tt (°C) | Time (min) | 0.44 | - | Mod-1 | Mod-1 | Std | Std | Mass | Volume | Pett |
| Number | (KIS) | (μm) | (g/m°) | (0) | (0) | (1111) | ₿ ₀ AC | n ₀ | Pair (psig) | (psid) | r _{air} (psig) | (psid) | 9 | in* | (g/cm*) |
| AF2892 | 224.0 | 20.00 | 0.50 | -13.4 | -6.8 | 17.7 | 1.33 | 0.60 | 19.4 | 49.9 | | | 291.2 | 26.8 | 0.66 |
| AF2895 | 224.0 | 21.40 | 1.12 | -21.7 | -15.1 | 7.7 | 1.33 | 0.60 | | | 15.6 | 11.6 | 307.2 | 26.1 | 0.72 |
| AF2896 | 224.0 | 21.30 | 1.54 | -25.5 | -18.8 | 5.6 | 1.33 | 0.60 | 15.0 | 80.0 | 15.0 | 7.0 | 367.0 | 29.9 | 0.75 |
| AF2897 | 224.0 | 21.30 | 1.54 | -25.5 | -18.8 | 5.6 | 1.33 | 0.60 | 15.0 | 80.0 | 15.0 | 7.0 | 361.1 | 29.4 | 0.75 |
| AF2898 | 224.0 | 21.40 | 1.12 | -21.7 | -15.1 | 7.7 | 1.33 | 0.60 | 10.0 | 30.0 | 10.0 | 5.0 | 323.5 | 27.6 | 0.72 |



Test Case Summary Ice Accretion on 2D Geometry

Baseline Test Case

≻Ref. AIAA 2014-2613

- ▶18-inch chord NACA 23012, 2 deg. AoA
 - 2 cases, double horn glaze ice and rime ice.

Optional Test Cases

≻Ref. SAE 2019-01-2022

▶72-inch chord NACA 23012, 2 deg. AoA

• 2 cases-1 monomodal and 1 bimodal drop distribution, mixed ice.

Ice Accretion on 2D Geometry

| ID | Title | Test facility | Year Data Type | Geometry | Reynolds (millions) | Air speed | MVD μm | LWC g/m3 | Tempe Reference rature | Vote for baseline 0/1 | Vote for optional 0/1 | Vote for future workshop 0/1 |
|----|---|------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------------|------------------------|-----------|-----------|-------------|--|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| 16 | 72-in NACA 23012 (EG1112) | IRT | 2016Tracings, photos, Cp | NACA 23012, straight, AoA 2 | 15 | 200 kts | 20 | 0.5 | -7.4 C NASA/TP-2016-218348 (static) | 4 | 6 | 0 |
| 17 | 72-in NACA23012, SLD (runs EG2819/EG2820) | IRT | 20193D scans, ice mass | NACA 23012, straight, AoA 2 | 15 | 200 kts | 20.8 | 1.64 | -12.6 C SAE 2019-01-2022 (static) | 5 | 6 | 2 |
| 18 | 18-in NACA23012 (ED1978) | IRT | 20143D scans, cp | NACA 23012, straight, AoA 2 | 3.5 | 200 kts | 15 | 0.75 | -2.2C AIAA 2014-2613 (total) | | 5 | 0 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | |

Selected as optional

Ice Accretion on 2D Geometry Baseline Case

18-in NACA23012 (ED1978) from AIAA 2014-2613

| Ice Shape | Run Number | α (°) | V (kts) | LWC (g/m ³) | MVD (µm) | T ₀ (°C) | Spray (min) |
|--------------------------|------------|-------|---------|-------------------------|----------|----------------------------|-------------|
| Glaze (Horn) | ED1978 | 2 | 200 | 0.75 | 15 | -2.2 | 5 |
| Roughness | ED1974 | 2 | 200 | 0.75 | 15 | -2.2 | 0.5 |
| Roughness | ED1983 | 2 | 200 | 0.4 | 30 | -17.8 | 1 |
| Rime (Streamwise) | ED1977 | 2 | 200 | 0.4 | 30 | -17.8 | 5 |
| Rime (Streamwise) | ED1966 | 5 | 175 | 0.3 | 15 | -17.8 | 5 |
| Runback (Spanwise Ridge) | ED1967 | 1 | 175 | 0.64 | 15 | -4.4 | 9.5 |

Table 1 Ice shapes tested for straight wing.





a) NACA 23012

18-in NACA23012 (ED1978) from AIAA 2014-2613

LWC (g/m^3) MVD (µm) Ice Shape Run Number α (°) V (kts) $T_0 (^{\circ}C)$ Spray (min) Glaze (Horn) 0.75 -2.2 ED1978 2 200 15 5 Roughness ED1974 200 0.75 15 -2.20.5 2 Roughness ED1983 2 200 30 -17.80.4 1 Rime (Streamwise) 200 30 -17.8ED1977 2 0.4 5 Rime (Streamwise) ED1966 5 175 0.3 15 -17.85 Runback (Spanwise Ridge) ED1967 175 0.64 15 -4.4 9.5 1







a) NACA 23012

Ice Accretion on 2D Geometry Optional Cases

3D Scanned Ice Shapes on 72-in NACA 23012, - SAE 2019-01-2022

TABLE 2 Test conditions for 72-inch chord, NACA 23012 airfoil model.

| | Test Condition | S | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|-----------------------|---------|---------|----------|------------|---------------------|---------------------|------------|----------------|---------------------------|--------------------|-------------------|
| | Run Number | α (deg) | V (kts) | MVD (µm) | LWC (g/m³) | T _t (°C) | T _s (°C) | Time (min) | n _o | P _{alr} , (psig) | Mod1 DP, (psid) | STD DP, (psid) |
| 1 | EG2814 | 5 | 175 | 20.8 | 1.77 | -4.7 | -8.7 | 5.20 | 0.19 | 15 | 80 | 7 |
| | EG2815 | 5 | 175 | 20.8 | 1.77 | -4.7 | -8.7 | 5.20 | 0.19 | 25.1 | | 22.9 |
| | EG2816 | 2 | 200 | 20.8 | 1.64 | -7.3 | -12.6 | 0.59 | 0.27 | 15 | 80 | 7 |
| - | EG2817 | 2 | 200 | 20.8 | 1.64 | -7.3 | -12.6 | 0.59 | 0.27 | 25.1 | | 22.9 |
| | EG2818 | 5 | 175 | 20.8 | 1.77 | -4.7 | -8.7 | 5.20 | 0.19 | 15 | 80 | 7 |
| | EG2819 | 2 | 200 | 20.8 | 1.64 | -7.3 | -12.6 | 6.63 | 0.27 | 15 | 80 | 7 |
| | EG2820 | 2 | 200 | 20.8 | 1.64 | -7.3 | -12.6 | 6.63 | 0.27 | 25.1 | | 22.9 |
| | EG2821 | 2 | 200 | 20.8 | 1.64 | -26.4 | -31.7 | 4.60 | 0.72 | 15 | 80 | 7 |
| | EG2822 | 5 | 175 | 20.8 | 1.77 | -4.7 | -8.7 | 5.20 | 0.19 | 25.1 | | 22.9 |
| | EG2823 | 2 | 200 | 20.8 | 1.64 | -26.4 | -31.7 | 4.60 | 0.72 | 25.1 | | 22.9 |
| - | EG2824 | 2 | 150 | 20.8 | 1.96 | -32.1 | -35.1 | 3.50 | >.85 | 15 | 80 | 7 |
| | EG2825 | 2 | 150 | 20.8 | 1.96 | -32.1 | -35.1 | 3.50 | 0.85 | 25.4 | | 23.3 |
| E | EG2826 | 2 | 200 | 20.8 | 1.64 | -7.3 | -12.6 | 6.63 | 0.27 | 15 | 80 | 7 |

3D Scanned Ice Shapes on 72-in NACA 23012, - SAE 2019-01-2022

| Test Condition | s | | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------|---------|---------|----------|------------|---------------------|---------------------|------------|----------------|---------------------------|--------------------|-------------------|
| Run Number | α (deg) | V (kts) | MVD (µm) | LWC (g/m³) | T _t (°C) | T _s (°C) | Time (min) | n _o | P _{air} , (psig) | Mod1 DP, (psid) | STD DP, (psid) |
| EG2819 | 2 | 200 | 20.8 | 1.64 | -7.3 | -12.6 | 6.63 | 0.27 | 15 | 80 | 7 |
| EG2820 | 2 | 200 | 20.8 | 1.64 | -7.3 | -12.6 | 6.63 | 0.27 | 25.1 | | 22.9 |



FIGURE 23 Ice shape profiles for runs EG2819 and EG2820 from center line of 72-inch chord NACA 23012 airfoil model.

| NACA23012 Airfoil Test Results | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------------------------|---------------------|-----------------------|-----------|-----------|---|---|----------------|--------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------|
| Run Numbers | Mass bimodal (g) | Mass monomodal (g) | ∆m (g) | ∆m (%) | Volume bimodal (in ³) | Volume monomodal (in ³) | ∆Vol. (in³) | ∆Vol. (%) | ρ _{eff,b} (g/cm³) | ρ _{eff,m} (g/cm³) | Δho_{eff} (%) |
| EG2819/EG2820 | 667.0 | 549.6 | 117.4 | 21.4% | 52.47 | 43.07 | 9.40 | 21.8% | 0.776 | 0.779 | -0.4% |

Collection Efficiency on 3D Geometry

Test Case Summary Collection Efficiency on 3D Geometry

Baseline Test Case

≻Ref. NASA TM-2002-211700

- NACA 64A008 finite swept tail, AoA = 6 deg.
 - 1 case: MVD = 21
- Three element airfoil, 36-inch nested chord, AoA = 4 deg.
 - 1 cases: MVD = 21

Optional Test Cases

- ≻Ref. NASA TM-2002-211700
- NACA 64A008 finite swept tail, AoA = 6 deg.
 - 1 case: MVD = 92
- Three element airfoil, 36-inch nested chord, AoA = 4 deg.
 - 1 cases: MVD = 92.
- ≻Ref. NASA CR 4257
- ≻Axisymmetric inlet at AoA = 15 deg.
 - 1 case: MVD = 20.4

| ID | Title | Test facility | Year Data Type | Geometry | Reynolds (millions) | Air speed | MVD μm | LWC g/m3 | Tempe rature | Reference | Vote for baseline 0/1 | Vote for optional 0/1 | Vote for future workshop 0/1 |
|----|--------------------|------------------|---|---|------------------------|-----------|-----------|-------------|-------------------|---------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------------------|---------------------------------------|
| 20 | Swept tail | IRT | 1997Collection efficiency, Cp | NACA 64A008 finite swept tail, AoA 6 | 5 | 176 mph | 21 | 0.15 | 291 K (static) | NASA TM 2002-211700 | | 2 | 3 |
| 21 | Axisymmetric inlet | IRT | 1989Collection efficiency, surface Mach | AoA 15, highlight diameter = 15 inches | 1 | 168 mph | 20.36 | ; | 50 F (static) | NASA CR 4257 | 2 | 7 | 4 |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | |

Selected as optional

Collection Efficiency on 3D Geometry Baseline Case

NACA 64A008 finite swept tail, AoA 6



Cylindrical End Cap

28.163"

26.714¹⁰

NASA TM 2002-211700 / NASA-TM-2005-213653

Three-element airfoil at $\alpha = 4^{\circ}$



| MVD = 21 microns | |
|---------------------------------|-----|
| Speed = 176 mph | |
| Mach = 0.23 | |
| Reynolds = 4.9M (deflected chor | d?) |
| Static Temperature* = 291.2 K | |
| Static Pressure* = 84337 Pa | |





Fig. 81 Comparison of experimental and INS2D pressure distributions for the three-element high lift system; $\alpha = 0^{\circ}$, M = 0.23, Re = 4.9 million, landing configuration, slat deflection 30 deg., flap deflection 30 deg.

| | Test Model | Number of Surface Pressure Taps | Angle of Attack (α) Flap deflection (δ) (degrees) | MVD (µm) | Average Air Speed | Number of Runs per MVD | Total Number of Runs |
|----|--|---------------------------------------|---|-------------|-------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------------|
| ?) | Three-element high lift system airfoil (36 in nested chord) Strip Location: Midspan | 128 | $\alpha = 0$ $\delta = Landing$ Configuration | 11.5,21 92 | 176 mph | 4 | 24 |



NASA TM 2002-211700

Collection Efficiency on 3D Geometry Optional Cases

NACA 64A008 finite swept tail, AoA 6



Cylindrical End Cap

26.714"

28.163"

NASA TM 2002-211700 / NASA-TM-2005-213653

Three-element airfoil at $\alpha = 4^{\circ}$



| MVD = 92 microns |
|------------------------------------|
| Speed = 176 mph |
| Mach = 0.23 |
| Reynolds = 4.9M (deflected chord?) |
| Static Temperature* = 291.2 K |
| Static Pressure* = 84337 Pa |
| |





Fig. 81 Comparison of experimental and INS2D pressure distributions for the three-element high lift system; $\alpha = 0^{\circ}$, M = 0.23, Re = 4.9 million, landing configuration, slat deflection 30 deg., flap deflection 30 deg.

| | Test Model | Number of Surface Pressure Taps | Angle of Attack (α) Flap deflection (δ) (degrees) | MVD (μm) | Average Air Speed | Number of Runs per MVD | Total Number of Runs |
|----|--|---------------------------------------|---|-------------|-------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------------|
| ?) | Three-element high lift system airfoil (36 in nested chord) Strip Location: Midspan | 128 | $\alpha = 0$ $\delta = Landing$ Configuration | 11.5, 21,92 | 176 mph | 4 | 24 |



Axisymmetric inlet at $\alpha = 15^{\circ}$



FIGURE 3.22 BLOTTER STRIP LOCATIONS ON AXISYMMETRIC INLET FOR a = 15°.



AXISYMM. INLET 08/11/86: MESH=77X73X16, UINF= 168.9 MPH, W=17.20 ALPHA = 15 DEG.MINF=.2328,MCF=.1697,TS=50.00F,PS=13.85 PSIA THETA= 0.00 0.50 0.45 0.40 0.35 -OUTER 0.30 0.25 0.20 0.1 0.10 - TEST DATA 6.00 0.00 X ~ INCHES FIGURE 6.9 EXPERIMENTAL AND ANALYTICAL SURFACE MACH NUMBERS FOR AXISYMMETRIC INLET (51) W = 17.20 LBM/SEC (PAGE 6 OF 17).

MVD = 20.36 microns

Speed = 168.9 mph

Mach = 0.2328





-3

-6



TIST DATA



Test Case Summary

| Category | Configuration | Baseline | Optional |
|--------------------------------------|--------------------------------------|----------|----------|
| les Accretion en 2D Coomstru | NACA 0012, 30 deg sweep | 2 | 2 |
| ice Accretion on 5D Geometry | NACA 0012, 45 deg sweep | 2 | 0 |
| les Assertion en 2D Coomstru | 18-inch chord NACA 23012 | 2 | 0 |
| ice Accretion on 2D Geometry | 72-inch chord NACA 23012 | 0 | 2 |
| | NACA 64A008 finite swept tail | 1 | 1 |
| Collection Efficiency on 3D Geometry | Multi-element airfoil | 1 | 1 |
| | Axisymmetric inlet at α = 15° | 0 | 1 |